Chronos- Revue d’Histoire de l’Université de Balamand, is a bi-annual Journal published in three languages (Arabic, English and French). It deals particularly with the History of the ethnic and religious groups of the Arab world.

Journal Name: Chronos
ISSN: 1608-7526
Title: Art, Archaeology and Christian Identity in Contemporary Lebanon and Syria
Author(s): Emma Loosley

To cite this document:

Permanent link to this document: DOI: https://doi.org/10.31377/chr.v23i0.456

Chronos uses the Creative Commons license CC BY-NC-SA that lets you remix, transform, and build upon the material for non-commercial purposes. However, any derivative work must be licensed under the same license as the original.
ART, ARCHAEOLOGY AND CHRISTIAN IDENTITY IN CONTEMPORARY LEBANON AND SYRIA

EMMA LOOSLEY

Introduction

In western society, as in the rest of the world, the vast majority of teenagers mould their identity by reacting to the world around them. However this sense of identity is unlikely in the early twenty-first century to be predicated by religion; music, sport, fashion and choice of friends are the elements by which schoolchildren and students define themselves and, with the notable exception of some members of minority religions, Faith is unlikely to play a major part in their formation of “self”. There is little understanding as to why immigrant Muslim, Sikh or Hindu communities place such a high value on their children remaining within the orbit of the local place of worship, as religion is seen by many of the white majority as a peripheral part of life.

It is these attitudes that make it very difficult for outsiders to understand the passion of Lebanese and Syrian Christians for the oral histories and folk beliefs that tie them so closely to the land that they inhabit. It is also even more mystifying that so many young people should take such an interest in issues such as etymology in order to prove that their family can claim an undisputed presence in a particular region many centuries ago. In Britain the fact that I know exactly which village in southern England my father’s family comes from and the meaning of my surname makes me eccentric — in Lebanon or Syria

1 University of Manchester.
2 Rather unromantically it is an old English name meaning “the pig sty in the clearing [of the forest]”.

Chronos n° 19 - 2009
this kind of information is commonplace. I remember being told by a Christian bedu tribe, Bayt Habib, that their residence in the town of Qaryatayn was a recent event as they had only moved there from Basireh in the seventeenth century, by contrast relatively few people in Western Europe would be able to talk of their family history with this certainty when referring to the events of four hundred years ago. This continuity is also expressed by an intimate familiarity with the landscape and it is this attachment, in particular the growing resurgence of young Lebanese and Syrians visiting shrines, monasteries and historic churches that this paper seeks to explore.

Preliminary Issues

In 1998 there was a pilgrimage to Resafa in the Syrian desert to commemorate the martyrdom of Saints Sergius and Bacchus. A banner proclaimed “Saint Sergius and Saint Bacchus, 397-1997”. Once the confusion over the date was resolved (“So, we’re one year late, so what?”) the importance of the pilgrimage became clear. With St. Sergius such a formative figure in Oriental Christianity it seemed obvious that the pilgrimage would be popular, but of the thousands of people who converged on the site in a convoy of coaches, the vast majority were in their mid-late teens and twenties and they came as Scout troops, Church choirs and youth groups. Not only did they enthusiastically participate in the service held in the ruined basilica that once held the saints’ relics but they also went on guided tours around the deserted city in order to gain some understanding of the site where it is believed Sergius and Bacchus were martyred by their fellow Roman soldiers. This is where the heart of the matter lies; in Middle Eastern society where the domination of Islam largely means that the Christian heritage of the region is ignored, such public celebrations of a 2,000 year presence are a way of reminding young Christians that they have a past, and conversely a future, in a place where they are often made to feel outsiders.

This is a situation that is radically different between Syria and Lebanon and yet it cannot be denied that this appropriation of formerly Christian heritage is also now occurring in Lebanon. The south of the country is increasingly dominated by the partisans of Hezbollah, meaning that the Christian inhabitants in the region have been forced to re-evaluate their own relationship with the land around them.
Swathes of the south, parts of the Bekaa valley and the refugee camps around Tripoli are virtually no-go areas for Christians and in 2004, well before the current political upheavals, a Maronite priest seriously advised that a proposed visit to the old city of Tripoli was only undertaken in the presence of a well-connected local Sunni friend. With attitudes such as this even in a stable period of Lebanese politics one must question how Lebanese Christians view their relationship with their country. Yet to put all Christians in the same category is also to simplify a complex question. Whilst many Maronites appear uneasy in the north and south of the country, the Greek Orthodox and Melkite populations do not share these misgivings, as demonstrated in a statement issued on September 30th 2006 by Georges Kuweiter, Melkite Metropolitan of Saida and Deir El Kamar:

“The diocese of Saida and Deir El Kamar consists of 56 parishes extending from East Saida and the Chouf region to Nabatieh in the south. Fifty one parishes already have flourishing churches providing them with regular pastoral service. In the other parishes, the Catholics exercise their religious obligations in the Maronite churches. Furthermore, our churches receive our Christian Maronite brothers in the areas where they do not have churches. The diocese of Saida and Deir El Kamar is, by virtue of the official registers, our largest Melkite diocese in Lebanon seen the number of deputies representing it in the Parliament. It is known that each deputy is elected on the basis of 25000 votes; actually our diocese is represented by three deputies since the independence.”
(www.notredamedemantara.org/english/body.htm)

Despite this the Metropolitan acknowledges the difficulty of enticing back the population, which had fled during the civil war and the ensuing conflict with Israel, and unsurprisingly he identifies the ownership of territory as one of the key issues encouraging or discouraging return of the Christian population:

“The major problem we faced since the return of our children in the years 90 (sic) was selling territories. A great number of our parishioners having experienced the living standard in Beirut, Metn and Kesrwan and since they were loaded with ideas driving them to hate their region such as: “the South is not ours anymore,
the South is for the Palestinians”, they started selling the properties they inherited from their fathers and grandfathers with no effort nor pain. The diocese was forced to undertake an awareness campaign as much as possible, but it had to buy a large number of these real-estates in order to reassure the apprehensive among them. It used to have then some savings from the foreign donations offered to the diocese (sic). The purchase cost of these real-estates rose to 3,002,938 American dollars. Owning these real-estates reassured some people who have said: “if the archbishop was not convinced that we will remain in our territories, he would not have bought these real-estates.” We can say today that the return was real even if it is not at the same level of the pre-war. The complete return is totally conditional upon the economic and mainly political situation concerning the implantation of the Palestinian that constitutes the main worry of our children.”

Yet ironically it is heritage and a shared interest in history that can bring both sides together. In 2005, whilst preparing for a research trip to Iran, a Greek Orthodox monk who had travelled to the country to make a cultural documentary with Hezbollah aided the author of this paper — often a shared love of place can encourage relations rather than sow discord. A similar example of this occurs in Syria where the shrines of Sa’dnaya and Mar Elias, to name but two, bring people of different faiths to ask for healing at what are ostensibly Christian shrines, a phenomenon that occurs frequently at a more local level in places such as the shrine of Mar Elian esh Sharqi, in Qaryatayn. If we can accept the primal connection of communities to place and understand the emotive pull that is heightened by friction in the Levant, then the reader will be better equipped to understand the relationship between art, archaeology and cultural belonging.

**Origins: The evidence for Christianity in Lebanon and Syria**

The Limestone Massif of north-west Syria boasts the highest concentration of late antique monuments anywhere in the world. Many hundreds of limestone-built villages cling to the hillsides between Aleppo and the coast, where Antakya (ancient Antioch) bears testament to one of the first Christian communities in world. Despite
the fact that the Hatay region was ceded by France to Turkey in 1939, culturally and ethnically the region remains Syrian with the majority of the population comprising of Arabic-speaking Alawites and Greek (Rum) Orthodox Christians. From Antioch in the north down to Palestine in the south, the fertile coastal strip and mountainous hinterland was one of the earliest Christian heartlands in the world. This has been illustrated by the fact that Syria has the earliest securely dated building in the world (the house-church at Dura Europos which was in use before the town was destroyed in 256) and at Tyre (Sur) a church was revealed in the 1990's, after a bomb fell on the area, that has been identified with a cathedral praised by Eusebius of Caesarea at the time of Constantine the Great. With credentials like this the antiquity of the Lebanese and Syrian Christian communities is indisputable and they are rightly proud of their roles as guardians of sites mentioned in the Bible.

Having accepted this fact it makes it extremely difficult for outsiders to understand how so many local Christians can abandon this kind of heritage and leave the region. Even more inexplicable is the disinterest of many young Christians towards their cultural heritage and this apathy is contributing to a dislocation with the past that threatens the very survival of these communities.

**Syria and Lebanon: Refugees and Mountain People**

The first point in an exploration of this kind that needs to be clearly understood is the central difference between Lebanese and Syrian Christians. Whilst the Lebanese population has only been disrupted from the 1970's onwards due to war, the Syrian Christian population is largely made up of displaced people. Therefore in the case of Lebanon, dislocation from the family village, if it has occurred, usually happened only a generation ago. In Syria much of the Christian population only settled in its current location in the early years of the twentieth century as a result of the collapse of the Ottoman Empire.

Only in the villages of the Mouhafazat of Homs, the Syrian coast and in the Anti-Lebanon mountains are we dealing with communities with an unbroken Christian tradition of almost two thousand years; in the cities and the Jazireh the Christian population is dominated by those fleeing the Syrian Christian heartlands of the Tur ‘Abdin and ancient cities such as Urfa (ancient Edessa, modern Sanlurfa). When the
Armenian survivors of the 1915 genocide and the Assyrian Christians who fled to eastern Syria to escape the violence that accompanied the formation of the state of Iraq are added into this equation, it is easy to see how the urban Christian population of Syria is dominated by twentieth-century refugees. This is also the case in the rural Jazireh, due to the fact that this is a fertile area at the confluence of the Syrian, Turkish and Iraqi borders.

In Lebanon by contrast, with the exception of Armenian refugees, the Christian population of the country stayed where they had always lived. The only notable movement of Christians in Lebanon was economic, with people moving to the cities to make their fortune and others (famously including Gibran Khalil Gibran) travelling to the Americas in search of a new, more prosperous lifestyle. This kind of movement meant that Lebanese Christians were more likely to stay within their ancestral villages or to send money back to the family that remained there, unlike their Syrian neighbours who had already been dispossessed and were struggling to build new communities in a different land.

Of course the inhabitants of the Syrian coastal mountains, Wadi Nasara, the Anti-Lebanon mountains and the desert villages east of Homs had always remained static and therefore took a different view of their surroundings. Pilgrimages to local shrines continued and a sense of continuity with the past meant that these communities were less likely to migrate as they had a strong awareness of their long history in the region. The exception to this seems to have been the Qalamoun, where many inhabitants left for South America, particularly Argentina, in the late nineteenth century. The abandonment of the Qalamoun seems at least in part to be linked to the desertification of the region, which has damaged traditional agriculture and even affected the herds that wandered the foothills of the Anti-Lebanon; it is the continuation of this process that fuels emigration today. Failure of ancient agricultural and pastoral systems and lack of alternative work is the biggest impetus to twenty-first century population movement in rural Syria, with many young people expressing a wish to stay but citing lack of work as their reason for leaving.

By contrast Lebanon offers a vibrant and dynamic economy, even after the Israeli attacks of 2006, but a perceived lack of security is what has driven many Lebanese to seek a life elsewhere. Despite these very different circumstances the question facing both countries is
fundamentally the same; is it possible to stem Christian emigration and to preserve the Christian heritage of the region?

Valley of the Fathers: The Case of Wadi Qadisha

In Lebanon the spiritual heritage of the country is part of a growing movement to try and anchor young people to the country and prevent emigration, it is also a tool used to foster a sense of belonging in the Lebanese diaspora. The use of historical sites is an integral part of this movement with the outstanding beauty of the region contrasted with the ancient hermitages and monasteries of the valley offering a unique way of tying Christian youth groups with their origins. During the civil war the inaccessibility of the valley added to its mystique and discoveries such as the mummies of Asi-l-Hadat (GERSL 1993) later added to the impression that the valley had been a Christian sanctuary from oppressors for many centuries. This link with the past has provided the impetus for a number of initiatives where the ancient shrines of Lebanon have been used as the focus of youth camps in order to impart some sense of what it means to be a Lebanese Christian to youth groups. The Antonine Sisters have started a programme of “Eremetical Days” in Wadi Qannoubine (Hourani & Hachchi 2004:451-65) and a UNESCO funded project for fresco restoration at the same foundation was another way to introduce students to living and working together in the valley (Pers. Comm. Faculté de l’Art Sacré, Université Saint Esprit, Kaslik). This movement has been aided by interest in a group of new saints in Lebanon. The shrines of St Rafqa, St Charbel Makhlouf and St Nmatullah Hardini (beatedified as recently as 1998) have encouraged a form of religious and cultural tourism in which pilgrims visiting the tombs of the saints stop and explore the monasteries where these saints spent their lives; there is an increasing realisation that the isolation and extreme conditions of the Lebanese mountains — beautiful but treacherous in the winter — are a factor in the spiritual life of the region and this combination of natural beauty, spirituality and romantic cliff-hugging monasteries and hermitages is proving a growing factor in initiatives to keep younger Lebanese in touch with their heritage.

One element of this fascination with the romance of the mountains could be simply that these remote monasteries represent a permanence and peace in the country that escapes the young elsewhere.
As the remoteness of the region, lack of roads and infrastructure protected the valleys during the war, it is only since the 1990's that the region has been “discovered”. It is not associated with the events of the war and the ruins are symbols of romance and historical decay in stark contrast with the bullet-scarred shells that litter the coast and Bekaa valley. This is therefore not just symbolic of an un-scarred and peaceful Lebanon, but also stands for the historical refuge of Lebanese Christians. The image of a beautiful spiritual heartland for all Lebanese Christians has been disseminated widely across the Lebanese diaspora due to modern methods of communication. The Internet has revolutionized how diaspora communities relate to their original homelands. Whereas in the past second or third generation members of diaspora communities relied on the memories of parents and grandparents to teach them about the lost homeland, now websites and internet chat-rooms, combined with cheap air travel, mean that there is more contact with the “Old World”, although whether this leads to less idealisation of the homeland or not is still open to question. The fact that images are readily available along with blogs written by young Lebanese still resident in the country, brings a sense of the wider Lebanese community closer to young people resident in Europe, the Americas or Australia. Gone are the days when verbal tradition and occasional letters marked contact with “home”. The “Global Village” phenomenon means that cousins on different sides of the world who can discuss the same music shown on MTV and wear the same fashion labels are also able to celebrate the same Saints days and discuss Lebanese politics and questions of national identity regularly through Beirut-hosted websites. The events of 2006 have intensified this strong sense of cyber-Nationality and strengthened the emotional attachment to this idealised Lebanese spiritual landscape.

These movements are facilitated by the fact that Lebanese Christians are mobile, generally financially secure and IT literate; but how does this compare with Christians across the border in Syria who are generally poorer and have less access to twenty-first century technology?

The Desert and the Sown: The Village and the City

In the early twentieth century Gertrude Bell called her book on her travels in Syria The Desert and the Sown to distinguish the major
differences between the inhabitants of the country. Around a hundred years ago the major difference in Syrian life was between the bedu and the fellahin — the pastoralist and agricultural lifestyles. Nowadays the biggest rift in society is between the city and the village. Whereas in the past only wealthy families, skilled artisans and an urban worker/servant class lived in the city with the rest of the population staying in their ancestral villages, since the 1970's Syrian cities have swelled so that estimates now suggest that between a quarter and a fifth of all Syrians live in Damascus — and this is without taking into account the populations of Aleppo, Homs, Hama and Lattakia. Obviously such a dramatic move away from an agrarian and pastoralist economy has had a traumatic effect on the social fabric of the country and inevitably caused some cultural dislocation. Just as the Lebanese were forced by war to re-evaluate their relationship with their homeland, the Syrians have had to accept a changing world economy meaning that they have had to adapt or fall into extreme poverty.

Whilst these changes have had far-reaching effects for all members of Syrian society, it can be argued that this new socio-economic model has been particularly disruptive for Christian communities. Whereas at the beginning of the twentieth century the vast majority of Christians in Syria were refugees from Asia Minor and Iraq who settled in the cities and north-eastern Syria with nothing, nowadays it is these very immigrant communities who have prospered in comparison with the longer-established rural Christian communities. The reasons for this are universal; increased demand for urban property means that many early twentieth-century suburbs are now centrally located and amongst the most desirable residential quarters of Syrian cities. The Christian community living in and around Bab Touma and Bab Sharqi were regarded as simply too poor to move to more modern accommodation on the slopes of Mount Qassioun, until the 1990's produced a fashion for renovating traditional Damascene houses and meant that many formerly impoverished families found themselves living in valuable properties. However these urban classes have become the most divorced from their traditional roots and, coupled with the fact that they are generally better educated and have more disposable income, they are far more likely to emigrate than their rural counterparts.

Even where social cohesion places a certain amount of pressure on urban communities to stay, a sense of historical continuity is often
missing amongst urban Christians and a strengthening of ties with the land is a strong deterrent against emigration. As this author wrote in an earlier article (Loosley 2005:289-596) a community initiative in Aleppo to take groups of Syrian Orthodox Christians out to the Limestone Massif of north-west Syria encouraged a sense of belonging when it was pointed out that, although the inhabitants of Hay Suryan originate from Edessa (modern Sanhurfa), this is relatively close to Aleppo if contemporary international borders are disregarded. In this context the Urfali began to associate with the landscape around them and to realise that they were potentially descended from the very people who had once populated the countryside north and west of the city in which they are now resident.

This new association with the territory also allowed the city-dwellers to re-evaluate their relationship with the Church. Traditions which seem arcane in a modern context make more sense when viewed in their historical light in a late antique context; liturgical processions and elaborate ritual take on an additional layer of meaning if they are viewed through the lens of their original landscape.

This kind of connection has never been broken in rural communities but there a different problem has arisen; over centuries of poverty and isolation there is a sense of inferiority when rural Christians compare themselves to their urban cousins. Whilst a sense of pride persists in villages where certain rituals, particularly local feast days, can be traced back in an unbroken line for over one-and-a-half millennia, there is also a lack of self-worth. Interestingly the curiosity of outsiders, whether they are foreigners or perceived urban sophisticates from within Syria, causes these village communities to take more interest in their local history. However, the passion for local history and re-connecting with ancient traditions that has spread across Lebanon since the end of the civil war has yet to reach Syria. Whether or not this is purely because the Syrian Christian community is too poor to take advantage of tools such as the internet or it is because the Syrian diaspora is not as well established as the Lebanese overseas network it is hard to ascertain at the time of writing and is an area that needs further work.

What does the future hold?

Naturally nobody can see into the future but with the increased
emigration of Christians throughout the Middle East, particularly encouraged by the war in Iraq and Israeli attacks on Lebanon in 2006, it is certain that Lebanese and Syrian Christian diaspora communities will continue to grow. In some cases this can actually feed into a spiritual renewal in the original homeland — there are already reports of Lebanese Christians from Latin American countries returning as hermits and monks to Wadi Qadisha and we cannot rule out that this movement may expand and reverse current trends. Equally the construction of the Syrian Orthodox seminary of Mar Afrem in Mar'aat Saydnaya north of Damascus has provided a strong, Syrian-based centre for the Church and by educating all aspirant monks and priests in the same environment, it means that all clergy have a common language and cultural milieu to draw upon, wherever they originate from and wherever they are finally allocated to their monastery or parish. Despite this, there are as many cultural models as there are diasporas and it is unclear at the moment whether the Lebanese model will follow the Armenian model, where far more Armenians live outside the small geographical area designated as contemporary Armenia as live in the modern state, or perhaps will end up closer to Armenia's neighbour and rival Georgia, where three million of the world's four million Georgians live in the modern state of Georgia and the vast majority of the remainder plan to retire there.

The answers to these questions of course rely on many exterior factors; in Lebanon people, especially those with young families, will not consider returning until there is a stable and functional infrastructure operating in the state. In Syria economic problems exacerbated by first Lebanese and then Iraqi refugees over the last few years have led to increased unemployment and inflation. It must also be acknowledged that the actions of the Christian communities in these two countries reflects a wider movement amongst the Christians of the entire Middle East; similar issues affect Christians in Turkey, Jordan, Palestine, Egypt, Iraq and Iran, without moving on to the situation further afield in North Africa and the Arabian Peninsula.

The reason why Lebanon and Syria are such important barometers of Christian presence in the region is that they are the countries with the most freedom and equality for Christians in the region. Whilst the rights of Christians are enshrined in the Lebanese constitution, in Syria the Christians are a presence in a government supported by a coalition of religious minorities. This means that these
two countries represent the “best case scenario” and if Christian communities are in danger of disappearance in Lebanon and Syria then there is very little chance that a presence in the region will remain viable in the long term.

Of course the real threat to Christian identity in the region is the obliteration of historical artefacts. Whereas neither Lebanon nor Syria has a deliberate policy of destruction like that of the Turkish destruction of Armenian sites, there is a danger that sites are being put at risk by bureaucratic apathy and lack of funds. In Lebanon the weak authority of the Department of Antiquities means that very little work is being sanctioned at the moment. In the meantime frescoes are literally dropping off of the walls in many medieval churches. Over in Syria poorly supervised excavations are leaving sites open to robbers with world-famous sites such as Amrit targeted in the last few years; we know about Amrit because of its high profile, but few of the lesser known sites ever appear on the radar screen of public opinion.

Another, all too real, hurdle is the rapid urbanisation in both countries. Lebanon is now one long developed strip almost without a break from Tripoli to Tyre. In Syria Aleppo is slowly expanding into the Limestone Massif and Damascus long ago swallowed the ancient collection of settlements that inhabited the oases created by the river Barada. As development spreads so archaeological evidence is destroyed and a lack of legislation, coupled with widespread disinterest makes it difficult to combat this erosion of cultural heritage. This is not intended to be a rallying call to combative cultural vigilantism, but on the other hand if the authorities realise that historical monuments are a priority within the population at large then they are likely to treat them with more respect, especially if the site has potential as a tourist attraction.

This call for cultural awareness is particularly important for Christians who have historically been more open-minded about their heritage than some Muslim counterparts. Whilst by no means casting all Muslim curators into the same category, it is depressing how little attention is paid to Romano-Byzantine artefacts in the region’s museums and this suggests an anti-Christian bias in the organisation of such institutions. Whilst the Bronze Age sites are always well represented and the Hellenistic era tolerably covered, the period from the Romans up until the Islamic expansion is always badly served. Labels are poor or non-existent and rarely are the artefacts assigned a clear provenance. This is a factor common in all the museums that I
have visited in Syria and in Lebanon it is difficult to make a judgement as the National Museum suffered so badly during the war. Unless younger Christians take more of an interest in these matters and protest their erasure from the historical record the situation is unlikely to improve.

Conclusion

This has been an attempt to explore the relationship that ties young Lebanese and Syrian Christians to their cultural and religious patrimony and to encourage them to take a more active role in conserving this heritage. As Lebanese society in particular becomes wealthier and more families have a higher proportion of disposable income, it is time for younger people to move away from simply vocational studies such as Medicine and Engineering. Whilst the study of Art History or Archaeology may not bring extensive financial rewards they will ultimately yield a high cultural dividend by keeping the majority of the population rooted in their ancestral homeland. Such a gift is priceless and it would be a tragedy if short-term financial advantage were to be favoured above the protection of an ancient and unique heritage; if Christians abandon the Levant the whole of Christendom will be cut adrift, therefore the native Christian population are saddled with the ultimate gift and the ultimate responsibility.

September 2007
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Various Lebanese websites were used to gauge attitudes to religious tourism in Lebanon and to for official church statements. Only www.notredamedemantara.org/english/body.htm was used for quotations.